



Dinas a Sir Abertawe

Cofnodion Cyfarfod y **Gweithgor Craffu - Gwasanaethau Bysus**

O bell drwy Microsoft Teams

Dydd Mercher, 7 Gorffennaf 2021 am 2.00 pm

Yn Bresennol: Y Cyngorydd L R Jones (Cadeirydd) oedd yn llywyddu

Y Cyngorydd(wyr)

N J Davies
L James
C L Philpott

Y Cyngorydd(wyr)

D W Helliwell
P K Jones
G J Tanner

Y Cyngorydd(wyr)

C A Holley
P Lloyd
T M White

Hefyd yn bresennol

Mark Thomas

Aelod y Cabinet dros Wella'r Amgylchedd a Rheoli Isadeiledd

Swyddogion

Stuart Davies
Liz Jordan
Cath Swain

Pennaeth Priffyrdd a Chludiant
Swyddog Craffu
Rheolwr yr Uned Cludiant Integredig

Ymddiheuriadau am absenoldeb

Y Cyngorydd/wyr: P Downing

1 Datgeliadau o fuddiannau personol a rhagfarnol

Datganodd Paul Lloyd gysylltiad personol.

2 Gwahardd Pleidleisiau Chwip a Datgan Chwipiau'r Pleidiau

Ni wnaethpwyd unrhyw ddatganiadau.

3 Cwestiynau Gan y Cyhoedd

Derbyniwyd y cwestiynau canlynol gan aelodau o'r cyhoedd:

CWESTIWN 1:

Yng Nghyfrifiad 2011, Abertawe oedd â'r gyfran isaf o deithiau byr a wnaed gan gludiant cyhoeddus yn y DU gyfan. Mae gennym rwydwaith bysus nad yw'n gwneud llawer mwy na mynd â phobl i ganolfan siopa sydd ag ychydig iawn o siopau, y mae llai a llai o bobl am fynd iddynt. Mae'n costio £2 i barcio yng nghanol y ddinas drwy'r dydd ond mae'n costio £5 i 1 person fynd yno ar fws. Mae'n costio £4 i barcio yn y Mwmbwls am 3 awr, ac eto mae'n costio £5 i 1 person fynd yno ar fws.

Nid oes gan y rhan fwyaf o'r ddinas wasanaethau bysus uniongyrchol i'r orsaf drenau na Stadiwm Liberty ar ddiwrnodau gêm. Mae arnom angen gwasanaethau bysus uniongyrchol sy'n cysylltu gwahanol rannau o'r ddinas. Rhaid i ni symud oddi wrth y syniad bod yn rhaid i bob bws fynd i'r Cwadrant.

Mae'r Iseldiroedd wedi cynnal arolwg teithio cenedl bob blwyddyn ers 1978. Gofynnir i ddinasyddion gofnodi pob taith maent yn mynd arni, a defnyddir yr wybodaeth hon i helpu i sicrhau bod dewisiadau amgen dichonadwy ar gael yn lle teithio mewn car.

Yn hytrach na chanolbwyntio ar brofiad defnyddwyr bysus, dylai'r cyngor newid ei ffocws i'r mwyafrif llethol nad ydynt yn ddefnyddwyr bysus, a phenderfynu pa newidiadau sydd eu hangen er mwyn i fwy o bobl ddewis cludiant cyhoeddus. Mae angen i'r cyngor gynnal astudiaeth i asesu pa wasanaethau sydd eu hangen ar breswylwyr mewn gwirionedd, ac ymrwmo i ddarparu dewisiadau amgen cystadleuol i deithio mewn car, wrth nodi targedau i gynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n defnyddio bysus (a theithio llesol) a thargedau i leihau nifer y teithiau ceir ar ein ffyrdd.

YMATEB -

Aelod y Cabinet:

"Mae gwasanaethau bysus i ganol y ddinas yn rhedeg ar sail fasnachol. Nid ydynt yno i fynd â phobl i'r siopau yn unig. Fe'u defnyddir hefyd i gyrraedd y gwaith etc.

Mae cymharu taliadau parcio ychydig yn annheg gan fod y prisiau a ddyfynnir o ganlyniad i gynigion parcio ceir ar hyn o bryd. Mesur dros dro yw hwn i gynorthwyo adferiad. Mae'r un peth yn wir ar gyfer y cynnig yn y Mwmbwls; mesur dros dro ydyw. Felly, nid yw'n gymhariaeth wirioneddol i'w chymharu â theithiau bws.

Bysus i Stadiwm Liberty – mae cwmnïau bysus yn gweithredu bysus yn bennaf lle mae galw amdanynt, gan eu bod yn weithrediad masnachol.

O ran yr arolwg cenedlaethol a gynhelir ledled yr Iseldiroedd, nid wyf yn dweud bod hyn yn rhywbeth na allwn ei wneud neu na ddylem ei wneud. Byddai'r teithiau presennol a wneir yn rhoi map ffordd i ni o'r math o deithiau y mae pobl am eu gwneud.

Gan ganolbwyntio ar ddefnyddwyr bysus, mae'n debyg mai ni sydd wedi cael y cyllid mwyaf ar gyfer unrhyw awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru, i wella a chynyddu ein llwybrau teithio llesol ledled Abertawe ac ar draws Abertawe at yr union ddiben hwnnw. Mae angen i ni newid o ddibynnu'n llwyr ar geir i fathau eraill o drafnidiaeth – mae gwasanaethau teithio llesol a bysus wedi'u cynnwys yn hynny. Mae'n rhywbeth rydym yn bwriadu'i wneud er gwaethaf gwrthwynebiad mewn rhai manau. Bydd yn ein diogelu yn y dyfodol. Er mwyn cael pobl allan o geir mae angen i ni ddod o hyd i'r dewis amgen yn lle hynny.

Mae 80 y cant o'r gwasanaethau bysus yn Abertawe yn cael eu gweithredu gan gwmnïau masnachol. Rydym ni fel Awdurdod wedi parhau i gynnal cymhorthdal ar gyfer gwasanaethau bysus i roi cymhorthdal ar gyfer llwybrau nad ydynt yn fasnachol ddichonadwy."

Rheolwr-gyfarwyddwr, First Cymru:

"Nid yw'r gost yn y darlun yn gywir. Darperir llawer o ysgogiadau. Dyma'r 'sefyllfa waethaf'.

Mae llawer o wasanaethau'n mynd ar draws y ddinas. Er enghraifft, mae Gwasanaeth 25 Blaen y Maes – Dinas, yn stopio yn yr orsaf drenau ac ar Ffordd y Brenin. Gall rhai arosfannau fod yn brysur felly ni allwn, er enghraifft, redeg pob bws drwy'r orsaf drenau.

Byddai'n ddiddorol gofyn i'r sawl a ofynnodd y cwestiwn am fanylion ynghylch o ble y maent yn teithio er mwyn deall y pryder yn fwy.

O ran cymudwyr, rydym yn cario llawer o weithwyr manwerthu yn ogystal â phobl yn y diwydiant gofalu. Mae un prif wasanaeth yn teithio o Ysbyty Singleton i Ysbyty Treforys. Mae nifer o wasanaethau nad ydynt yn mynd yn uniongyrchol i'r Cwadrant at ddibenion siopa.

Mae gennym feddalwedd soffistigedig iawn sy'n dangos y defnydd o safleoedd bysus ar draws y ddinas. Rwy'n hapus i rannu rhagor o wybodaeth â'r gweithgor am ble y mae pobl yn teithio yn y ddinas, a all eich helpu ar y sefyllfa honno.

Abertawe yw un o'r dinasoedd mwyaf prysur rwyf wedi'i gweld yng Nghymru. O ystyried agenda Llywodraeth Cymru ar newid yn yr hinsawdd, mae angen i bob un ohonom gymryd cyfrifoldeb am geisio symud pobl i gludiant cyhoeddus.

Yr un her sydd gennym fel diwydiant yw ei bod wedi lleihau. Mae nifer y bobl sydd bellach yn teithio ar fws wedi gostwng yn ddramatig. Bob degawd gwelwn farchnad sy'n lleihau, yn enwedig ymhlith y genhedlaeth iau y mae gan lawer ohonynt eu cerbydau eu hunain.

Er mwyn delio â'r agenda newid yn yr hinsawdd, mae angen newid moddol. Rydym yn gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i gyfrannu drwy wella'n cerbydau, cael y cerbydau mwyaf effeithlon a defnyddio technoleg ar ein cerbydau i wella'r agenda hinsawdd, ond mae perygl enfawr yng Nghymru gan nad ydym wedi cael buddsoddiad fel lleoedd eraill. Mae angen i ni symud ymlaen yn gynyddol yn fy marn i."

Pennaeth Priffyrdd a Chludiant:

"Mae llawer o waith parhaus yn cael ei wneud fel awdurdod ac yn rhanbarthol ar y Metro gyda Llywodraeth Cymru a Thrafnidiaeth Cymru, ac mae ymrwymiad cryf o ran newid moddol i gludiant cyhoeddus o ansawdd uchel. Mae llawer o ddatblygiad yn mynd rhagddo i weld sut gallwn integreiddio'n iawn rhwng dulliau teithio, tocynnau etc.

Rydym yn gweithio gyda First Cymru i edrych ar heriau ar y rhwydwaith yn rheolaidd.

O ran teithio llesol, mae gan yr awdurdod ymrwymiad cryf iawn. Mae'n bwysig bod pawb yn cefnogi'r math hwnnw o symudiad. Er enghraifft, wrth Bont Pentre Road a Thre-gŵyr, rydym yn ceisio darparu lle diogel i bawb ei ddefnyddio ond mae pobl wedi gwrthwynebu hyn. Mae angen i ni newid calonnau a meddyliau er mwyn i bobl gefnogi ein cynlluniau."

CWESTIWN 2: (codwyd y cwestiwn hwn gan 4 aelod o'r cyhoedd)

Parthed Gwasanaeth Bws Llandeilo Ferwallt. Rhif 14: Pennard i Abertawe

Dyma ein HUNIG fws gyda chyswllt uniongyrchol ag Abertawe.

Mae'n bwysig ei fod yn rheolaidd ac os yw'n hwyr, mae'n bwysig nad yw'n osgoi dod drwy Landeilo Ferwallt a Murton. (Roeddwn i'n aros yn Llandeilo Ferwallt yn ddiweddar ac ni ddaeth y bws, ond roedd fy ffrind wedi gallu mynd ar y bws yn Mayals a oedd ar amser. Yn amlwg, penderfynodd y gyrrwr BEIDIO â chymryd llwybr Llandeilo Ferwallt).

Dylem gael gwasanaeth bob awr sy'n mynd i'r ysbyty ar bob taith, sy'n ddibynadwy ac sydd mor brydlon â phosib.

YMATEB –

Rheolwr-gyfarwyddwr, First Cymru:

"Rydym wedi cael llawer o adborth ar y llwybr hwn. Y pethau sylfaenol y dylid eu disgwyl yw y dylai'r bws fod yn brydlon ac na fyddai disgwyl iddo golli rhannau o lwybrau. Bydd yn ddiddorol cael manylion llawn y cwestiwn hwn (ynglŷn â'r bws yn colli Llandeilo Ferwallt) er mwyn ymchwilio'n llawn i'r pryder hwn.

Mae'n un o'r gwasanaethau nad yw'n talu holl gostau amser gyrrwyr heb sôn am gost cerbydau, tanwydd a chynnal a chadw. Nid yw hynny hyd yn oed yn ystyried y potensial i wneud elw. Mae angen i ni naill ai edrych ar gynyddu nawdd ar y cerbyd neu ystyried sut y gallwn gynnig y gwasanaeth hwn mewn ffordd wahanol. Mae llawer o enghreifftiau ohonom yn dangos ein bod yn arloesol. Hoffem edrych ar y gwasanaeth hwn ychydig yn fanylach ac ystyried ai'r bws gwasanaeth ar ei ffurf bresennol yw'r ateb gorau. Rydym yn ymrwymedig i weithio gyda'r awdurdod lleol i edrych ar atebion amgen i'r cynnig penodol hwnnw a gweld a allwn wella'r cynnig i'r cwsmer sy'n bodloni'r galw a'r goblygiadau cost i'r cwmni."

Cynullydd y Gweithgor:

"Hapus i wrdd â First Cymru am hyn y tu allan i'r cyfarfod."

Aelod y Cabinet:

"Llwybr masnachol yw hwn felly nid yw'n ymwneud yn uniongyrchol â ni ond byddwn yn ceisio cwrdd â First Cymru a cheisio dod o hyd i ffordd ymlaen."

Cynghorydd Pennard:

"Os oes unrhyw gyfarfodydd am Rif 14 hoffwn gael fy nghynnwys."

"Mae llawer o bobl yn rhoi'r gorau i ddefnyddio'r bws oherwydd bod yr amserlen yn ddryslyd. Felly mae angen i beth bynnag a ddefnyddiwn fod yn rheolaidd."

Rheolwr Gyfarwyddwr, First Cymru:

"Ar hyn o bryd rydym yn cludo tua 130 o deithwyr y dydd ar y gwasanaeth hwn. Dros y 18 mis diwethaf nid yw'r gwasanaeth wedi bod yn rheolaidd oherwydd COVID.

Rydym yn benderfynol y byddwn yn gwella cyfathrebiad â chwsmeriaid pan fyddwn yn dod allan o hyn. Mae cynyddu nifer y cwsmeriaid ar ein holl wasanaethau yn bwysig i mi."

4 **Cyflwyniad gan fysus First Cymru**

Cyflwynodd Jane Reakes-Davies, Rheolwr Gyfarwyddwr First Cymru drosolwg o'r cwmni i'r Gweithgor.

5 **Cyflwyniad gan gwmni Cardiff Bus/Bws Caerdydd**

Cyflwynodd y Cynghorydd Lay, Cadeirydd a'r Cynghorydd Hill-John, Is-gadeirydd drosolwg o Bws Caerdydd i'r Gweithgor gan gynnwys pwy ydynt, sut mae'n gweithio, heriau, manteision a'r dyfodol.

6 **Adroddiad Gwasanaethau Bysus**

Roedd Mark Thomas, Aelod y Cabinet dros Wella'r Amgylchedd a Rheoli Isadeiledd, Stuart Davies, Pennaeth Priffyrdd a Chludiant a Cath Swain, Rheolwr yr Uned Drafnidiaeth Integredig yn bresennol ar gyfer yr eitem hon. Cadarnhaodd yr Aelod Cabinet fod yr awdurdod lleol yn gallu ystyried dilyn llwybr drwy ddull â chymhorthdal os na all gweithredwr masnachol wneud hynny. Mae'r awdurdod lleol hefyd yn cefnogi trafnidiaeth gymunedol drwy ddulliau â chymhorthdal. Cadarnhaodd yr Aelod Cabinet nad yw'r awdurdod lleol yn gallu rhedeg ei wasanaethau bysus ei hun ar hyn o bryd.

7 **Trafodaeth a Chasgliadau**

Cododd aelodau'r Gweithgor nifer o gwestiynau y gwnaeth First Cymru, Bws Caerdydd, yr Aelod Cabinet a swyddogion ymateb iddynt.

Trafodwyd y prif faterion canlynol:

- Nododd yr Aelodau bwysigrwydd cael gwasanaeth bws rheolaidd i bob ardal i fynd i'r afael ag unigedd preswylwyr.
- Teimlai'r Aelodau y defnyddiwyd cyllid teithio llesol i'w gwneud yn haws i bobl feicio neu gerdded, ond nid yw pawb yn gallu gwneud hyn ac mai hygyrchedd yw'r prif bwynt, i'r henoed etc.
- Teimlai'r Aelodau'n gryf fod bysus yn wasanaeth pwysig ac os ydym am gael newid moddol, rhaid i gludiant cyhoeddus fod yn asgwrn cefn i'r hyn yr ydym yn mynd i'w wneud.
- Teimlai'r Aelodau fod angen mwy o ddeialog rhwng cynghorwyr a chwmnïau bysus, yn enwedig First Cymru, i drafod lle y gellir gwneud rhai newidiadau er budd preswylwyr Abertawe a helpu cwmnïau bysus i gynyddu nifer y teithwyr.
- Teimlai'r Aelodau hefyd fod angen gofyn pam nad yw pobl yn dal bysus a pham mae'r niferoedd yn lleihau, ac mae'r angen i wrando ar wybodaeth leol hefyd yr un mor bwysig. Cadarnhaodd cynrychiolydd First Cymru ei bod yn awyddus i

siarad â chynghorwyr a swyddogion perthnasol am rai gwasanaethau, yn enwedig Gwasanaeth 14 a 29 ac am gynyddu nawdd.

- Dywedodd Cadeirydd Bws Caerdydd fod angen i ni roi cyhoeddusrwydd i'n cwsmeriaid ynghylch yr hyn rydym yn ei wneud yn iawn gyda chludiant cyhoeddus yn Abertawe, er enghraifft, pa mor gyflym y gallwch fynd i ganol y ddinas ar fws yn ystod adegau prysur o gymharu â char.
- Holodd yr Aelodau sut mae First Cymru yn cyfrifo'i bris wrth dendro i'r cyngor am lwybrau tendro agored â chymhorthdal. Cadarnhaodd First Cymru eu bod yn edrych ar gost y gwasanaeth penodol hwnnw, yn seiliedig ar y gyrrwr, y cerbyd, nifer yr oriau gyrru, costau tanwydd a chynnal a chadw a etc.
- Holodd yr Aelodau sut y mae Bws Caerdydd yn pennu eu prisiau. Cadarnhawyd eu bod yn eu pennu ar sail fasnachol. Maent yn edrych ar brisiau eu cystadleuwyr, ac yn edrych ar eu costau mewnol eu hunain ac yn cynnig pris. Mae ganddynt nifer o gystadleuwyr sy'n tueddu i weithredu ar y llwybrau mwy proffidiol ac mae Bws Caerdydd yn cymharu ei brisiau â nhw.
- Cododd yr Aelodau mater ansawdd aer. Roeddent yn falch o glywed bod First Cymru wedi ymrwymo i ddod yn weithredwr aer glân erbyn 2035 ac i roi'r gorau i ddefnyddio pob cerbyd diesel o 2025. Dywedodd First Cymru fod rhai cerbydau trydan, mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru, wedi'u hariannu gan gronfa'r Adran Drafnidiaeth ar gyfer ardaloedd a ddiffinnir fel parthau awyr glân (gan gynnwys Caerdydd). Fodd bynnag, nid oes unrhyw un o'r ardaloedd hyn yn ardal weithredu First Cymru, sy'n golygu nad ydynt wedi gallu gwneud cais am gerbydau o'r fath.
- Dywedodd yr Aelodau fod bysus mewn rhai lleoedd, fel Caerwysg, yn diffodd peiriannau wrth stopio wrth oleuadau traffig coch nes bod goleuadau'n troi'n wyrdd. Holwyd First Cymru a yw hyn yn rhywbeth y maent wedi meddwl amdano ac yn barod i'w gyflwyno, oherwydd o safbwynt allyriadau byddai'n gam aruthrol i'r cyfeiriad cywir.
- Gofynnodd yr Aelodau i First Cymru am enghreifftiau o gymhellion tocynnau y maent yn eu cynnig. Teimlai'r Aelodau y dylai cymhellion fod ar gael drwy ddulliau eraill ac nid drwy ap ffonau symudol yn unig. Dywedodd First Cymru eu bod yn agored eu meddwl i edrych ar gynigion tocynnau.
- Cododd yr Aelodau mater trosglwyddo tocynnau a holwyd pam na all pob gweithredwr dderbyn tocynnau. Ymatebodd First Cymru fod hyn yn uchel ar yr agenda ar gyfer Llywodraeth Cymru a Thrafnidiaeth Cymru. Ar hyn o bryd nid oes systemau clir y mae pob gweithredwr yn eu defnyddio. Mae First Cymru'n credu bod hyn yn rhywbeth a gaiff ei gyflwyno fel rhan o ddiwygio bysus.
- Gofynnodd yr Aelodau i First Cymru a fyddant yn ystyried gwneud llwybrau cylchol yn Abertawe. Ymatebodd First Cymru gan ddweud eu bod yn awyddus i ddeall mwy am hyn a byddai angen ei drafod y tu allan i'r cyfarfod.
- Holodd yr Aelodau am y gwahaniaeth yng nghostau teithio, am yr un hyd o daith, yng Nghaerdydd ac Abertawe. Dywedwyd bod hyn yn anodd ei ateb gan fod pob ardal yn cynnig ysgogiadau gwahanol.
- Teimlai'r Aelodau fod nifer o ardaloedd lle gellir manteisio i'r eithaf ar y gwasanaethau bysus a ddarperir, er enghraifft nawdd. Roeddent hefyd yn teimlo nad oes unrhyw feddwl cydlynol rhwng amserau bysus a threnau a gofynnwyd a all yr awdurdod archwilio ble y gellir cydlynu gwasanaethau, er

enghraifft, canolfannau trafndiaeth a throsglwyddo tocynnau ar gyfer bysus rheilffordd. Nododd First Cymru fod hyn yn rhwystredigaeth iddynt am eu bod wedi gweithio gyda chwmnïau trenau i alinio gwasanaethau ond nawr mae amserlenni wedi newid. Hefyd, lle'r oeddent wedi gweld canolfannau trafndiaeth yn cael eu cyflwyno, er enghraifft Port Talbot, nid oeddent wedi denu nifer y bobl yr oeddent yn ei ddisgwyl i ddefnyddio bysus. Ychwanegodd yr Aelod Cabinet fod yr Awdurdod wedi derbyn cyllid gan Lywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer astudiaethau dichonoldeb i edrych ar ganolfannau ym Mhontarddulais a Thre-gŵyr i'w gwneud yn fwy hygyrch i fysis gyrraedd yr orsaf.

- Ychwanegodd First Cymru fod Trafnidiaeth Cymru wedi ymrwmo i gael y system deithio integredig hon a bydd First Cymru yn gwneud popeth o fewn ei allu i weithio gyda nhw ar yr agenda hon wrth symud ymlaen. Dywedodd swyddogion mai integreiddio yw'r flaenoriaeth y mae'r metro'n ceisio'i chyflawni, i gael llwybrau beicio a cherdded etc. yn y canolfannau, a bydd y Metro'n datblygu'r holl bethau hyn.
- Awgrymodd Bws Caerdydd i'r Aelodau, os ydynt wir am weld newid i wasanaethau bysus yn Abertawe, fod gwir angen iddynt annog yr awdurdod i weithio gyda First Cymru i symud bysus o amgylch y ddinas mor hawdd â phosib a gwella'r isadeiledd, oherwydd er mwyn cynyddu nawdd mae angen cynyddu dibynadwyedd.

Yna trafododd Aelodau'r Gweithgor gynnydd a gwnaed y casgliadau a'r argymhellion canlynol:

1. Hoffem ddiolch i'r holl yrwyr bysus a phersonél sydd wedi parhau i weithio drwy'r pandemig a chludo gweithwyr allweddol i'w swyddi. Maent wedi chwarae rhan hanfodol.
2. Hoffem bwysleisio pwysigrwydd cwmnïau bysus a chludiant cyhoeddus yn cyfrannu'n fwy cyffredinol at leihau allyriadau carbon. Rydym yn disgwyl i'n cwmnïau bysus symud oddi wrth danwydd ffosil yn gyflym ac yn llwyr. Dywedwyd wrthym y byddai First Cymru yn weithredwr aer glân erbyn 2035. A allant geisio symud yn gyflymach a chyflawni hyn erbyn 2030, fel eu bod yn gwneud cyfraniad yn unol ag ymrwymiad Cyngor Abertawe i fod yn sero net erbyn 2030.
3. Teimlwn fod angen gwasanaethau bysus rheolaidd i bob rhan o Abertawe. Mae hyn yn arbennig o bwysig er mwyn lleihau unigedd a dechrau symud oddi wrth ddefnyddio ceir i ddefnyddio cludiant cyhoeddus.
4. Rydym yn argymhell y dylid cynnal cyfarfodydd rheolaidd rhwng Aelodau a First Cymru i godi a thrafod materion fel newidiadau i lwybrau, amserlenni, cynyddu nawdd etc. a gofynnwn i hyn gael ei drefnu.
5. Os bydd newid moddol, teimlwn fod angen i Aelodau etholedig gymryd rhan mewn trafodaethau ar sut y bydd yr awdurdod yn gwneud hyn. Hoffem gael sicrwydd gennyh yn glŷn â hyn.

6. Teimlwn ei bod yn bwysig iawn i'r awdurdod a chwmnïau bysus wrando ar bobl nad ydynt yn defnyddio bysus yn Abertawe ar hyn o bryd, yn ogystal â phobl sy'n gwneud hynny, i helpu i lunio gwasanaethau bysus ar hyn o bryd ac yn y dyfodol.
7. Hoffem weld cwmnïau bysus yn cynnig mwy o gymhellion ar gyfer teithio rheolaidd ac yn cynnig cymhellion mewn nifer o ffurfiau, nid yn unig drwy apiau ffonau symudol.
8. Teimlwn nad oes cydlyniad rhwng amserau bysus a rheilffyrdd, a gofynnwn i'r awdurdod archwilio ble y gellir cydlynu gwasanaethau. Roeddem yn falch o glywed bod dwy astudiaeth dichonoldeb yn cael eu cynnal i edrych ar ganolfannau trafndiaeth mewn dwy ardal yn Abertawe ond mae angen gwneud llawer mwy.
9. Hoffem bwysleisio pwysigrwydd cyflwyno opsiwn trosglwyddo tocynnau rhwng gweithredwyr bysus a bysus a rheilffyrdd er hwylustod preswylwyr Abertawe ac i gynyddu nawdd. Hoffem gael sicrwydd bod yr awdurdod yn gwneud popeth o fewn ei allu i symud yr agenda diwygio teithio yn ei blaen gyda Llywodraeth Cymru a Thrafnidiaeth Cymru cyn gynted â phosib.
10. Cytunwn â'r awgrym gan Bws Caerdydd bod yr awdurdod a First Cymru yn cydweithio i symud bysus o amgylch y ddinas mor hawdd â phosib, er mwyn helpu i wella dibynadwyedd. Gan mai dim ond ychydig o ffyrdd sydd i mewn ac allan o Abertawe, bydd pwyntiau tagfeydd bob amser yn broblem. Teimlwn y bydd angen gwella lonydd bysus i helpu i oresgyn hyn.
11. Rydym yn pryderu bod pwyllgor craffu wedi llunio adroddiad tua 2012/13 a oedd yn trafod llawer o'r un problemau ac a ddaeth i'r un casgliadau â'r Gweithgor hwn ond, yn anffodus, ni chymerwyd unrhyw gamau. Gobeithiwn y bydd yr awdurdod yn awr yn gwrandao ar ein pryderon ac yn gweithio tuag at gyflawni atebion.
12. Byddwn yn argymhell i Bwyllgor y Rhaglen Graffu y dylid cynnal cyfarfod dilynol o'r Gweithgor hwn ymhen chwe mis i weld pa newidiadau/welliannau a wnaed, ac yn dilyn hynny benderfynu a oes angen i'r Gweithgor gyfarfod eto chwe mis ar ôl hynny. Credwn ei bod yn hanfodol bwysig ein bod yn gweld newidiadau cadarnhaol yn digwydd er budd preswylwyr Abertawe.

Yn dilyn y cyfarfod hwn:

Caiff llythyr ei ysgrifennu oddi wrth gynullydd y gweithgor at Aelod y Cabinet sy'n crynhoi'r drafodaeth ac yn amlinellu meddyliau ac argymhellion y gweithgor.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4.05 pm



To:

**Councillor Mark Thomas
Cabinet Member for Environment
Enhancement and Infrastructure
Management**

BY EMAIL

CC Cabinet Members

*Please ask for:
Gofynnwch am:*

Scrutiny

*Scrutiny Office
Line:
Llinell
Uniongyrchol:*

01792 637314

*e-Mail
e-Bost:*

scrutiny@swansea.gov.uk

*Date
Dyddiad:*

09 August 2021

Summary: This is a letter from the Bus Services Working Group to the Cabinet Member for Environment Enhancement and Infrastructure Management following the meeting of the Working Group on 07 July 2021. It is about bus services in Swansea.

Dear Cllr Thomas

The Bus Services Scrutiny Working Group met on 07 July 2021 to look at bus network coverage and levels of service, community transport provision and integration with other forms of transport etc.

This letter provides you with feedback from that meeting.

We would like to thank you, Stuart Davies and Cath Swain for attending to present the report and answer questions. We appreciate your engagement and input.

We would also like to thank Jane Reakes-Davies of First Cymru, Cllr Christopher Lay and Cllr Gavin Hill-John of Cardiff Bus for taking the time to attend the meeting and present to the Group. We are very grateful for their engagement and input.

Public Question Time

The following questions were received from members of the public:

QUESTION 1:

OVERVIEW & SCRUTINY / TROSOLWG A CHRAFFU

SWANSEA COUNCIL / CYNGOR ABERTAWE

GUILDHALL, SWANSEA, SA1 4PE / NEUADD Y DDINAS, ABERTAWE, SA1 4PE

www.swansea.gov.uk / www.abertawe.gov.uk

I dderbyn yr wybodaeth hon mewn fformat arall neu yn Gymraeg, cysylltwch â'r person uchod
To receive this information in alternative format, or in Welsh please contact the above

In the 2011 Census, Swansea had the lowest proportion of short journeys made by public transport in the whole of the UK. We have a bus network that does little more than take people to a shopping mall that has increasingly few shops, which less and less want to go to. It costs £2 to park in the city centre all day yet costs £5 for 1 person to go there by bus. It costs £4 to park in Mumbles for 3 hrs, yet costs £5 for 1 person to go there by bus.

Most of the city does not have direct bus services to the train station or the Liberty Stadium on match days. We need direct bus services that link different parts of the city. We need to move away from the idea that all buses must go to the Quadrant.

Every year since 1978, the Netherlands has carried out a nation travel survey. Citizens are asked to record each journey they take, and this information is used to help ensure viable alternatives to travelling by car are provided.

Rather than focusing on the experience of bus users, the Council should switch its focus to the vast majority who are not bus users, and determine what changes are required for more people to choose public transport. We need the Council to conduct a study to assess what services residents actually need, and to commit to providing competitive alternatives to car travel, whilst setting out targets to increase the number of people using buses (and active travel) and targets to reduce the number of car journeys on our roads.

RESPONSE -

Cabinet Member:

“Bus services into city centre run on a commercial basis. They are not there just to take people into the shops. They are also used for getting to work etc.

The comparison of parking charges is a bit unfair as the prices quoted are because of offers on at the moment with car parking. This is a temporary measure to aid recovery. It is the same for the offer in Mumbles; it is a temporary measure. Therefore, it is not a true comparison to compare with bus journeys.

Buses to the Liberty Stadium – bus companies run buses predominantly where demand is as they are a commercial operation.

With regards the nationwide survey carried out in the Netherlands, I am not saying this is something we cannot or should not do. The current journeys carried out would give us a road map of the type of journeys that people want to make.

Focussing on bus users, we have probably got the most funding of any local authority in Wales, to improve and increase our active travel routes throughout and across Swansea for that very purpose. We need to make a modal shift from total reliance on cars into other forms of transport – active travel and bus services are included in that. It is something we intend to do despite opposition in some quarters. It will future proof us. In order to get people out of cars we need to find the alternative to that.

Eighty percent of bus services in Swansea are run by commercial companies. We as an Authority have continued to maintain a subsidy for bus services to subsidise routes that are not viable on a commercial basis.”

Managing Director, First Cymru:

“The cost in the illustration is not correct. Many incentives are provided. This is the worst case scenario.

Many services go across the City. For example, Service 25 Blaen Y Maes – City, stops at the train station and the Kingsway. Some stops can get congested so we cannot for example, run all buses through the train station.

It would be interesting to understand the concern more from the person who asked the question for specifics about where they are travelling from.

In terms of commuters, we carry a lot of retail workers as well as people in the caring industry. One main service is from Singleton Hospital to Morriston Hospital. There are a number of services that do not directly go into the Quadrant for shopping purposes.

We have very sophisticated software that shows the use of bus stops across the City. Happy to share with the working group more information about where people are travelling in the City, which may help you on that position.

Swansea is one of the most congested cities I have seen in Wales. Given the Welsh Government’s agenda on climate change, we do all need to take responsibility for trying to move people into public transport.

The one challenge we have as an industry, is that it has diminished. The number of people who are now travelling by bus has reduced dramatically. Every decade we see a diminishing market, particularly amongst the younger generation many of whom have their own vehicles.

To deal with the climate change agenda a modal shift is required. We do all we can to contribute by improving our vehicles, getting the most efficient vehicles and using technology on our vehicles to improve the climate agenda, but there is a huge risk in Wales as we haven’t had investment like other places. We need to move forward more progressively in my opinion.”

Head of Highways and Transportation:

“There is a lot of ongoing work as an Authority and regionally looking at the Metro with Welsh Government and Transport for Wales, and there is a strong commitment in terms of modal shift to high quality public transport. There is a lot of development going on to see how we can get proper integration between modes of transport, ticketing etc.

We work with First Cymru to look at challenges on the network on a regular basis.

In terms of active travel, the Authority has got an extremely strong commitment. It is important that everyone gets behind that sort of move. For example, the Pentre Road Bridge and Gowerton, we are trying to provide a safe place for everyone to use but

have had resistance to this. We need to change hearts and minds to get support behind schemes.”

QUESTION 2: (this question was raised by 4 members of the public)

Re Bishopston Bus Service. No14: Pennard to Swansea

This is our ONLY bus with direct link to Swansea.

It is important that it is regular and if late it does not miss coming through Bishopston and Murton. (I was waiting in Bishopston recently No bus appeared, but my friend was able to pick the bus up on the Mayals which was on time. Obviously driver decided NOT to take in the Bishopston loop).

We should have an hourly service which takes in the hospital on all journeys, is reliable and is as punctual as possible.

RESPONSE –

Managing Director, First Cymru:

“We have had a lot of feedback on this route. The basics that should be expected are that it should be on time and would not be expected to miss bits of routes out. Be interesting to have the full details on this question (regarding the bus missing out Bishopston) to fully investigate this concern.

It is one of the services that is not covering its costs of drivers’ time let alone cost of vehicle, fuel and maintenance. That is not even looking at the potential for profit. We either need to look at increasing patronage of the vehicle or look at how we can offer this service in a different way. There are many examples of us being innovative. We would like to look at this service in a little more detail and look at whether the service bus in its current guise is the best solution. We are committed to work with the Local Authority to look at alternative solutions to that particular proposition and see if we can improve the offering for the customer that meets the demand and cost implications to the company.”

Working Group Convener:

“Happy to meet with First Cymru about this outside of the meeting.”

Cabinet Member:

“This is a commercial route so it is not directly to do with us but we will try to meet with First Cymru and try to find a way forward.”

Councillor for Pennard:

“If there are any meetings about Number 14 can I be included.”

“Many people are giving up using the bus because the timetable is confusing. So whatever we use needs to be regular.”

Managing Director, First Cymru:

“We are currently carrying about 130 passengers per day on this service. Over the last 18 months the service has not been regular due to Covid.

We are determined we will improve communication to customers when we come out of this. Growing customer numbers on all our services is important to me.”

Following Public Question time, Jane Reakes-Davies presented an overview of First Cymru to the Working Group. Following this Cllr Christopher Lay and Cllr Gavin Hill-John similarly presented an overview of Cardiff Bus including Who they were, How it works, challenges, benefits and the future.

As the Cabinet Member, you presented the Bus Services Report and confirmed that the Local Authority is able to consider taking on a route through a subsidised method if a commercial operator is unable to. The Local Authority also supports community transport through subsidised methods. You also confirmed that currently the Local Authority is unable to run its own bus services.

Members of the Working Group raised a number of questions that First Cymru, Cardiff Bus, yourself and officers responded too.

The following main issues were discussed:

We stated the importance of getting a regular bus service to all areas to tackle residents' isolation. People who have given up driving need to be able to access public transport otherwise they become prisoners in their own home.

We felt funding for active travel has been used to make it easier for people to cycle or walk, but not everyone is able to do this and that accessibility has to be the main point, for the elderly etc.

We felt strongly that buses are an important service and that if we are going to have a modal change, public transport has to be the backbone of what we are going to do.

We felt that more dialogue is needed between councillors and bus companies, particularly First Cymru, to discuss where changes can be made for the benefit of residents of Swansea and also help bus companies to increase passenger numbers.

We also felt that there is a need ask why people are not catching buses and why numbers are diminishing and equally and importantly there is a need to listen to local knowledge. We gave the example that if we are looking to support Council policy we should be looking to support local shopping district centres, for example in Sketty, the Service 29 bus does not go through the local shopping centre. Jane Reakes-Davies of First Cymru confirmed she is keen to talk to relevant councillors and officers about some services, particularly Service 14 and 29 and about growing patronage.

The Chairman of Cardiff Bus, Cllr Christopher Lay stated that we need to publicise to our customers what we are doing right with public transport in Swansea, for example, how quickly you can get into the City Centre by bus in peak times compared to a car.

You agreed that we do not publicise the benefits of taking the bus often enough and added that we also need to change the perceptions of the public.

We queried how First Cymru works out its price when tendering to the Council for open tender subsidised routes. First Cymru confirmed that when submitting a tender to the Local Authority they look at the cost of that particular service, based on the driver, the vehicle, number of driving hours, fuel and maintenance costs etc.

We queried how Cardiff Bus set their fares. It was confirmed that it is done on a commercial basis. They still have to be in the black and have to charge fairly. They look at their competitor's prices and look at their own internal costs and come up with a price. They are the dominant operator in Cardiff but not the only operator. They have a number of competitors who tend to operate on the more profitable routes and Cardiff Bus compares its prices to them.

We raised the issue of air quality. We were pleased to hear that First Cymru is committed to becoming a clean air operator by 2035 and to cease all diesel forms from 2025. We were also impressed to hear that Cardiff Bus has made a significant investment in electric buses and would like to see this in Swansea as soon as possible. First Cymru stated that some electric vehicles, in other parts of Wales, had been funded by a Department of Transport fund for areas defined as clean air zones (including Cardiff). However, there are not any of these areas within First Cymru's operating area, which means they have not been able to bid for such vehicles. Officers stated with regard to the Metro, the Authority is working closely with the Welsh Government and Transport for Wales to secure funding for a number of improvements, and that low emission vehicles (whether electric or hydrogen) is very high on the agenda.

We stated that in some places, like Exeter, buses switch off engines when stopping at red traffic lights until lights go green. We queried with First Cymru if this is something they have thought about and are prepared to introduce, as from an emissions point of view it would be a tremendous step in the right direction. First Cymru stated they have a number of vehicles that have stop-start technology, which reduces idling. In terms of switching engines off, they stated they would need to speak to engineering colleagues outside of the meeting, as it takes some time for buses to re-start, and would then provide members with a full response.

We asked First Cymru for examples of ticket incentives that they offer. First Cymru responded that for daily tickets, for example, if you buy five tickets in advance you get discount via a mobile app. They do not currently have off peak offers. We felt incentives should be available via other means not just via the app. First Cymru stated they are open minded to looking at ticketing offers.

We raised the issue of cross-ticketing and queried why tickets cannot be accepted by all operators. First Cymru responded that this is high up the agenda for Welsh Government and Transport for Wales. They stated that there are currently no clear systems that all operators use. Currently all ticket machines are very different so it is not possible to split out the revenue. We heard Transport for Wales are keen to

improve the offering for all bus companies to have consistent ticket machines and be able to have multi-operator and integrated transport ticketing between bus and rail. First Cymru believe this is something that will be introduced as part of bus reform.

We asked First Cymru if they will consider doing circular routes in Swansea. First Cymru responded saying they are keen to understand more about this and it would need to be discussed outside of the meeting. They stated they are happy to hear representations and look at how they can build this into the network if it will deliver an improved patronage.

We queried the difference in journey cost, for the same length of journey, in Cardiff and Swansea. We were informed this is difficult to answer as all areas offer different incentives. However, in terms of the daily ticketing offer, it is 60p cheaper in Swansea than Cardiff.

We felt there are a number of areas where the bus services provided can be maximised, for example patronage. We felt we had made such suggestions to First Cymru in the past but that nothing had been done about it. We also felt that there is no joined up thinking between bus and train times and asked if the Authority can examine where services can be coordinated, for example, transport hubs and cross-ticketing for rail-bus. First Cymru stated that this is a frustration of theirs and that they have worked with train companies to align services but then timetables have changed. They informed the Group that they have 60 buses that go past the main train station in High Street every hour and that many of the smaller stations do not have the infrastructure to turn buses safely. They added that where they had seen transport hubs introduced, for example Port Talbot it had not attracted the volume of people to board or alight the bus that they expected. You added that the Authority has received funding from the Welsh Government for feasibility studies to look at hubs in Pontarddulais and Gowerton to make it more accessible for buses to get down to the station.

First Cymru added that Transport for Wales is committed to having this integrated travel system and First Cymru will do everything it can to work with them on this agenda going forward. You and the Vice Chair of Cardiff Bus agreed that a holistic approach across Wales with Transport for Wales is the way forward and you are hopeful for change. Officers stated that integration is the cornerstone of what the Metro is trying to achieve, to have bikes and walking routes etc at the hubs and all these things will be progressed by the Metro.

Cllr Gavin Hill-John of Cardiff Bus suggested to us that if we really want to see a change to bus services in Swansea, we really need to encourage the Authority to work with First Cymru to move buses around the City as easily as possible and improve the infrastructure, as to grow patronage there is a need to increase reliability. Officers stated that Swansea does have a lane bus system, which is there to give priority through junctions at congestion hot spots and that a lot of money is being invested to improve reliability.

Working Group Members then discussed progress and made the following conclusions and recommendations:

1. We would like to give our thanks to all bus drivers and personnel who have carried on working through the pandemic carrying key workers to their jobs. They have played a vital role.
2. We wish to emphasise the importance of bus companies and public transport more generally contributing to carbon emission reduction. We are expecting our bus companies to move quickly and radically away from fossil fuels. We were told First Cymru would be a clean air operator by 2035. Can they try and move quicker and deliver this by 2030, so they are making a contribution in line with Swansea Council's commitment to being net zero by 2030.
3. We feel that there needs to be a regular bus services to all areas of Swansea. This is particularly important to reduce isolation and start a shift away from car use to using public transport.
4. We recommend that regular meetings are held between Members and First Cymru to raise and discuss issues such as changes to routes, timetables, increasing patronage etc and would ask that this is arranged.
5. If there is going to be a modal change, we feel elected Members need to be involved in discussions on how the Authority is going to do this. We would like your assurance on this.
6. We feel it is very important for the Authority and bus companies to listen to people who currently do not use buses in Swansea, as well as people who do, to help shape current and future bus services.
7. We would like to see bus companies offering more incentives for regular travel and offering incentives in a number of forms not just via mobile apps.
8. We feel that there is no joining up between bus and rail times, and ask that the Authority examine where services can be co-ordinated. We were pleased to hear that two feasibility studies are taking place to look at transport hubs in two areas of Swansea but a lot more needs to be done.
9. We wish to emphasise the importance of cross ticketing being introduced between bus operators and bus and rail for the convenience of the residents of Swansea and to increase patronage. We would like assurance that the Authority is doing all it can to move the travel reform agenda forward with the Welsh Government and Transport for Wales as quickly as possible.
10. We agree with the suggestion by Cardiff Bus that the Authority and First Cymru work together to move buses around the City as easily as possible, to help improve reliability. As there are only a few ways in and out of Swansea,

congestion points are always going to be an issue. We feel to help overcome this that bus lanes will need to be improved.

11. We are concerned that a scrutiny committee produced a report around 2012/13 which went into many of the same problems and came up with the same conclusions as this Working Group but sadly no action was taken. We hope that the Authority will now listen to our concerns and work towards achieving solutions.

12. We will be recommending to the Scrutiny Programme Committee that a follow up meeting of this Working Group is held in six months, to see what changes/improvements have been made and following it decide if the Working Group need to meet again six months after that. We believe that it is vitally important that we see positive changes taking place to benefit Swansea residents.

Your Response

We hope you find this letter useful and informative. We are interested in hearing your thoughts about the issues raised and would ask that you respond to the points in our conclusions by 30 August 2021.

Yours sincerely

COUNCILLOR LYNDON JONES
CONVENER, BUS SERVICES SCRUTINY WORKING GROUP
CLLR.LYNDON.JONES@SWANSEA.GOV.UK

Cllr. Jones,
Convener of the Bus Services Scrutiny
Working Group

(By email)

Please ask for: Councillor Mark Thomas
Direct Line: 01792 63 6926
E-Mail: cllr.mark.thomas@swansea.gov.uk
Our Ref: MT/JG
Your Ref:
Date: 17 August 2021

Dear Cllr Jones,

**Re: - Convener's letter to Cabinet Member - Scrutiny Working Group Bus Services
7 July 2021.**

Thank you for your feedback from the Bus Services Scrutiny Working Group on 7 July 2021. I note your recommendations and conclusions and would provide the following comments in response to the points raised.

1. Thank you for recognising the efforts of drivers and personnel, with which we agree and we will be sure to pass that on.
2. First Cymru outlined their intention to be a clean air operator by 2035. The Welsh Government has a target of 2050 for net zero carbon emissions and in the New Wales Transport Strategy (2021) they set out their plans to achieve this which include reducing the need to travel by encouraging home working and the provision of local services, making public transport more attractive and promoting active travel. They also intend to roll out the technology and infrastructure to deliver ultra-low emission buses and to work with bus providers to help deliver these priorities.

As part of First Group, First Cymru's move to low emission vehicles will be part of a wider programme which will be determined by priority decisions made by the Group. However, the Welsh Government has indicated that it intends to work with the bus groups to encourage investment in their Welsh services, with longer-term funding horizons.

Swansea Council submitted a bid to the Welsh Government this year for Local Transport Funding to investigate the possibility of improving a strategic bus corridor as part of the S W Wales Metro programme. This bid was successful and feasibility studies are underway which include the possibility of introducing alternative fuelled vehicles as part of this scheme in conjunction with First Cymru.

The Council is also working with Transport for Wales and the Welsh Government on a scheme which could see the introduction of hydrogen buses on a network of key services in the Swansea Bay area.

3. The current legislation under which bus services operate puts the primary decisions on when and where bus services are provided with the commercial bus companies. Their decisions are primarily based on how profitable they feel the services will be. The Council's role is to identify where there are gaps in the services provided commercially and if it is felt that there is a social need for a service, then it can fund something to meet that need.

Swansea Council funds numerous bus and community transport services and has shown continued commitment to supporting public transport by maintaining its own revenue support of bus routes at £1.1 million over several years, in addition to the £0.5 million contribution from the Welsh Government in Bus Services Support Grant. Due to budget pressures, a number of other local authorities have reduced or removed their revenue support as it is not a statutory duty for Councils to fund these services.

4. The Council has signed a Quality Partnership Agreement with First Cymru which sets out the actions that both parties propose to improve bus services and make them more attractive and reliable in the Swansea area.

The Quality Partnership Board meets quarterly and comprises of Senior Officers from the Council and First Cymru together with the Cabinet Member and other Councillors who have a specific interest in public transport. The QPB considers bus service matters at a strategic level and receives regular updates from Transport for Wales on changes proposed to the national and regional bus service network.

Where bus companies propose significant changes to services locally, officers from the Transport Team ensure that the local ward Councillors are made aware of these. Regular Public Transport Bulletins have been produced throughout the period of the Covid 19 Pandemic and issued electronically to all Councillors to ensure that all are informed of the frequent, short notice changes that have been taking place to bus services in the past year.

5. / 6. / 7. The current legislation puts the Council in a position where it reacts to changes and decisions about bus services that are made by commercial operators and severely restricts the control that the Council has over bus services in the area. The Welsh Government has recognised this and alongside the new Wales Transport Strategy (2021) is intending to bring forward legislation which will give the public sector more control over local bus services. In future it is intended that much of the strategic transport planning of bus services will be undertaken through CJsCs who will prepare Regional Transport plans. In the meantime Council officers are working with Transport for Wales to develop Regional Bus Networks which will form the basis of the bus services that the Welsh Government will recognise and support in future.

8. Where bus services are funded by the Council, we try wherever possible to provide connections with rail and other bus services. In some cases this is not possible where bus routes are for multiple purposes, for example carry school / college pupils and commuters, and therefore need to arrive at these points at fixed times which may not fit with train times. Train operators set their timetables up well in advance but do not consult with commercial bus operators as a part of this process. The integration of bus

and rail services is one of the aspects that TfW and Welsh Government are looking at as part of the Bus Service Reform and Metro development process.

9. The Welsh Government is keen to develop an all Wales ticketing scheme for bus services which will make it easier and more attractive for customers. Transport for Wales and local authorities are looking at possible ways that this can be taken forward so that interchange between services becomes easier and tickets are accepted across the Country by multiple operators.

Locally operators have their own ticket schemes and promotions but there is no ticket inter availability between different bus companies.

10. The Council has been successful in obtaining funding for bus priority improvements on key corridors in the past and constructed a number of bus lanes. Bus priority is also provided at traffic signals. More recently the Council is implementing Latebus technology at busy signalised road junctions which detects whether a bus service is running late and if it is, gives it priority. If the bus is on time, no adjustment is necessary. This avoids the expense of building dedicated bus lanes and provides a more efficient use of road space.

11. The scrutiny report you refer to was presented to Cabinet on November 12th 2013 and put forward 13 recommendations. Having reviewed the report and Action Plan, I do not accept that no action was taken then, and indeed I believe that all of those recommendations which we could influence were positively addressed, and solutions were achieved.

12. I note that a follow up meeting of the Working Group is proposed in 6 months' time and I will be happy to provide an update as and when required.

Yours sincerely



Y Cynghorydd / Councillor Mark Thomas
Aelod Y Cabinet Dros Gwella'r Amgylchedd a Rheoli Isadeiledd/
Cabinet Member for Environment Enhancement & Infrastructure Management